

Parish: Thirsk
Ward: Thirsk
8

Committee date: 26 July 2018
Officer dealing: Miss Charlotte Cornforth
Target date: 31 July 2018

18/00217/FUL

**Construction of one detached dwelling and associated parking spaces
At Former Wisteria Cottage, 21 Station Road, Thirsk
For Moorside Developments**

This application is referred to Planning Committee at the request of a member of the Council

1.0 SITE, CONTEXT AND PROPOSAL

- 1.1 The application site is a narrow parcel of land between the residential dwellings of 21a and 20c Station Road. To the south of the site within the former curtilage of Wisteria Cottage, a total of eleven dwellings have been granted planning permission, some of which are under construction. The access to these dwellings passes through the site and the proposed dwelling would lie to the immediate west of it, with the vehicular access point curving around in front of the dwelling to achieve a central access point onto Station Road. The site lies within the Development Limits of Thirsk and Sowerby.
- 1.2 The total number of residential units that have been granted planning permission on the entire site (shown within the blue line) is eleven. The site layout plan as part of this application refers to this proposed dwelling as plot 11. However, plots 4 and 4a have planning permission for subdivision to form two dwellings (reference 17/02496/FUL). Therefore, this dwelling would form the twelfth dwelling as part of development site.
- 1.3 The proposal seeks the construction of one dwelling with two associated car parking spaces and garden space to the front and to the rear. The dwelling would have a sitting/dining room, kitchen, bathroom and one bedroom at ground floor, with two bedrooms and en-suite rooms in the roof space. The dwelling would be constructed from brick and pantile, with a timber frame entrance to the east and hanging tiles on the north, south and east gables. A bay window is proposed on the south elevation with a continuing brick wall (two metres in height) to form the boundary, garden wall between the dwelling and the garden of 21a Station Road.
- 1.4 To the west of the site is the residential dwelling of 21a Station Road and to the east the residential dwelling of 20c Station Road. Hedgerows form the boundaries and to the south of the site an additional parking space is shown for the development.
- 1.5 Overall, the site is surrounded by residential developments of differing styles, with park homes to the south on Millbank Court and more recently two storey dwellings on Turkan Close to the east. Properties on Station Road itself vary, including modest bungalows and larger two-storey dwellings.
- 1.6 Improvements have been secured as part of this application are as follows:
- Reorientation of the dwelling such that the roof ridge is parallel to Station Road;
 - A minor change to the front building line position;
 - A reduction in the height of the dwelling;
 - Repositioning of the entrance door to the east (side) elevation;
 - Reorientation of the two car parking spaces, with a turning area; and

- The rear garden hedge has been positioned at an angle to improve visibility when leaving the car parking spaces.

2.0 RELEVANT PLANNING AND ENFORCEMENT HISTORY

The Development Site

- 2.1 15/02006/OUT - Outline application for four dwellings including details of access; Granted 3 November 2015.
- 2.2 16/01420/REM – Details of appearance, landscaping, layout and scale of plots 1 and 2; Granted 8 September 2016.
- 2.3 16/02185/REM - Details of appearance, landscaping, layout and scale of plots 3 and 4; Granted 9 December 2016.
- 2.4 17/00493/FUL - Demolition of dwelling and construction of six new dwellings, garages and ancillary works; Granted 21 December 2017.
- 2.5 17/02294/FUL - Construction of single garages on plots 2 & 5 and plots 3 & 4; Granted 15 January 2018.
- 2.6 17/02496/FUL - Retrospective application for the subdivision of dwelling to two dwellings; Granted 19 January 2018.

3.0 RELEVANT PLANNING POLICIES

- 3.1 The relevant policies are:

Core Strategy Policy CP1 - Sustainable development
 Core Strategy Policy CP2 – Access
 Core Strategy Policy CP4 - Settlement hierarchy
 Core Strategy Policy CP16 - Protecting and enhancing natural and man-made assets
 Core Strategy Policy CP17 - Promoting high quality design
 Core Strategy Policy CP21 - Safe response to natural and other force
 Development Policy DP1 - Protecting amenity
 Development Policy DP3 - Site accessibility
 Development Policy DP4 - Access for all
 Development Policy DP8 - Development Limits
 Development Policy DP9 - Development outside Development Limits
 Development Policy DP10 - Form and character of settlements
 Development Policy DP30 - Protecting the character and appearance of the countryside
 Development Policy DP32 - General design
 Development Policy DP33 – Landscaping
 Development Policy DP43 - Flooding and floodplains
 Interim Guidance Note - adopted by Council on 7th April 2015
 Size, Type and Tenure of New Homes SPD - adopted September 2015
 National Planning Policy Framework - published 27 March 2012

4.0 CONSULTATIONS

- 4.1 Town Council – Objects to both the initial proposal and revised scheme. The proposed construction of a dwelling in this location would have a negative impact on both the street scene view and the approach to the new development, Wisteria Park Gardens, in a very detrimental way. It would have a detrimental impact on the

neighbouring property resulting in loss of privacy and overshadowing. It would reduce the visibility on the new estate access road.

- 4.2 Highway Authority – No objection subject to conditions regarding the private access/verge crossing requirements, the provision of the approved turning and parking areas, precautions to prevent mud on the highway and on-site parking, on-site storage and construction traffic during development.
- 4.3 Yorkshire Water – Based on the information submitted (foul only to public foul sewer, surface water to soakaway), no observation comments are required from Yorkshire Water.
- 4.4 Public comments – Three letters of objection were received regarding the initial scheme and a further letter has been received from one objector in respect of the amended proposal. A summary of the objections is:
- Overbearing impact;
 - Loss of light and shadowing;
 - Loss of privacy, overlooking to neighbouring dwellings;
 - Harm to bio-diversity due to hedgerow works;
 - Fumes from vehicles in the parking space;
 - Highway safety through increased traffic and impact upon neighbours through increased use of the site access road;
 - Appearance of the dwelling is at odds with the locality;
 - Lack of space around dwellings;
 - Artists impression is incorrect, falsely shows a hedge removed; and
 - Impact of construction work.

5.0 OBSERVATIONS

- 5.1 The main issues to consider are: (i) the principle of development; (ii) size, type and tenure; (iii) affordable housing; (iv) the impact on the character of the surrounding area, including design (v) residential amenity; (vi) highway safety; and (vii) drainage issues

Principle

- 5.2 The site located within the Development Limits of Thirsk and Sowerby and would be considered infill development in an otherwise built up residential frontage. As such, the proposal is considered to be a sustainable location for new development and would comply with Policy DP8, subject to an assessment of other relevant policy tests including design and impact on residential amenity.

Size, type and tenure

- 5.3 The dwelling would provide one downstairs bedroom and two in the roof space. The Size Type and Tenure of New Homes Supplementary Planning Document (2015) recognises that there is a need to provide more two and three bedroom market homes and to provide more choice for older people, including two bedroom bungalows. Whilst this proposal may not be for an outright single storey bungalow, there is provision at ground floor for a bedroom and bathroom and is therefore considered to provide the housing that is needed across the District.

Affordable housing

- 5.4 It should be noted that this dwelling would be the twelfth as part of the wider development site. The requirement for an affordable housing contribution in Thirsk,

set out in Policy CP9 is triggered by 15 houses (or sites of 0.5ha or more). The development of a further dwelling, giving an overall number of dwellings of 12 (11 net increase) does not reach the trigger for affordable housing.

Character of the area, including design

- 5.5 One of Hambleton's strategic planning objectives, set out in The Core Strategy Local Development Document (2007), is "To protect and enhance the historic heritage and the unique character and identity of the towns and villages by ensuring that new developments are appropriate in terms of scale and location in the context of settlement form and character."
- 5.6 Policies CP17 and DP32 require the highest quality of creative, innovative and sustainable design for buildings and landscaping that take account of local character and settings, promote local identity and distinctiveness and are appropriate in terms of use, movement, form and space.
- 5.7 There is not a uniform architectural style prevalent in the area, rather a wide range of building type and scale are apparent ranging from the Park Homes to the south, established individually designed dwellings to the west and the semi-detached dwellings to the north and the modern estate development to the east. The dwellings approved as part of the wider development site are two storey brick built dwellings with traditional fenestration details and chimneys.
- 5.8 The ridgeline of dwellings running parallel to the Station Road, with some gable details, is the prevailing characteristic of the area. The layout of the proposed dwelling respects the building line and orientation of roof of the dwellings on Station.
- 5.9 An artist's impression has been submitted as part of the application but it is not a drawing that can be used to confirm the details of the proposal or to control the final development in the case that enforcement action were necessary. Reliance should therefore not be made on this submission when assessing the scheme.
- 5.10 The proposed dwelling would add to the mix of house types and styles on the site. Care has been taken to provide a design that incorporates detailing to give interest and creates a 'gatehouse' at the front of the development site. The use of traditional brickwork and clay pantiles will respect the character of the area.
- 5.11 The alignment of the 5.5m wide access drive from Station Road deviates around the east side of the dwelling. The total width between the dwelling and the neighbouring dwelling to the east is about 7.2m. The arrangement of the site leaves a small space about 0.8m between the wall of the dwelling and the access drive and about 1.3m from the recessed entrance door to the access drive. This combined with the deviation of the access drive gives a cramped arrangement and appearance to the site.
- 5.12 The area of refuge for pedestrians at the entrance door to the dwelling is increased by the recessed position of the entrance door. No footway or highway service strip is provided to serve the dwellings to the rear and no scope to do so if this development is undertaken.
- 5.13 The detailed design of the dwelling responds to the challenge of a narrow site however the resulting scheme fails to respect the local context in terms of site layout and detailed design and results in compromises in terms of pedestrian access to the proposed dwelling and the access (both pedestrian and vehicular) to the approved development on land to the south.

- 5.14 The layout of the site and overall height of the dwelling would result in a substantial impact upon the neighbours to the west in terms of massing of the new building. The development would result in the loss of a visual break in the built frontage of Station Road. Together the impact of a new building and the loss of open space would intensify the sense that the development is cramped in to a space and results in harm to the qualities of residential character of the area.

Residential amenity

- 5.15 The dwelling of 21a Station Road is a two-storey dwelling has a porch and side room that faces onto the development site. It also has a rear conservatory. The boundary hedge would be retained and the positioning of the dwelling is set further to the south, away from the windows of the porch and side room.
- 5.16 The dwelling of 20c Station Road is a dormer bungalow with a rear conservatory. The boundary hedge would be retained and the access road is located between the eastern elevation of the proposed dwelling and 20c Station Road.
- 5.17 The main outlook and principal rooms for both 21a and 20c Station Road is to the north and south. This is also the same with the proposed dwelling. There is one ground floor window proposed in the western elevation, serving a bathroom, which would be obscure glazed and two roof lights are also proposed. There would be two ground floor windows on the eastern elevation, serving a kitchen and sitting/dining room. The access road separates the eastern elevation of the proposed dwelling and 20c Station Road.
- 5.18 The dwelling has been reduced in height to reduce the overbearing effect upon the neighbouring properties however, despite the reduction and position of the boundary hedge to the west of the site, the overall height of the dwelling at about 6.7m will have an overbearing effect on the dwelling at 21a Station Road.
- 5.19 It is considered that on balance, the proposed dwelling would achieve reasonable separation distances between principal room windows of neighbours; it is not therefore considered an unacceptable level of overlooking would be created by the proposals that would be detriment to amenity.
- 5.20 The site is capable of providing adequate private amenity space for the proposed dwelling to the front and to the rear.
- 5.21 The position of car parking spaces on site close to the rear of 21a has been approved in a similar arrangement in a previous scheme (17/00493/FUL). In any event it is not possible to demonstrate that a significant loss of amenity or health impacts would occur that would justify the refusal of planning permission.
- 5.22 The impact of the construction works are noted as a cause for concern to neighbours. Controls are available under powers exercised by the Environmental Health service of the Council in the event of harmful impacts from construction works. Impacts on the amenity of neighbours arising from construction works would not justify a refusal of planning permission.

Highway safety

- 5.23 It is proposed to utilise the existing access into the site from Station Road, realigning the private drive within the site along the eastern boundary. The Highway Authority has raised no objection to this means of access for an additional dwelling to those approved on the site. It is considered that the parking proposed is acceptable as the dwelling has two on site car parking spaces and turning space. Furthermore, the visibility splays would not be reduced as part of this proposal.

Drainage issues

- 5.24 Foul drainage would be disposed of via the mains and surface water to soakaways. The exact details of which can be agreed by planning condition. There is no evidence to suggest that the demands on the infrastructure of the village arising from the development would be so great that the infrastructure would be unable to cope with the additional development or cause harm to the amenity of the area.

Bio-diversity

- 5.25 Representations refer to the harm to bio-diversity due to the removal of a hedgerow. No evidence is available to show that the hedgerow is importance or that the value cannot be replaced by alternative provision. It is considered that any loss of habitat can be compensated by the creation of new habitat and would not give rise to a significant net loss of habitat that would justify refusal of this application.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION

- 6.1 That subject to any outstanding consultations permission is **REFUSED**

1. The development would result in a dwelling of cramped arrangement and appearance that do not respect the high quality of design required by Local Development Framework Core Strategy Policy CP17 and Development Policy DP32.